(iii) Reports of the Governor of Mizoram dated September 6 and 7, 1988 to the President recommending the issue of Proclamation.

[Placed in the Library. *See* LT No. 6571/88 for (ii) to (iii)]

REFERENCE TO THE ADDRESS OF THE PRIME MINISTER TO CONGRESS (I) RALLY

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, yesterday's newspapers carrying the text of the speech of the Prime Minister at the Red Fort in the Congress (I) Rally contained some accusations against the opposition as a whole. Sir, I quote from the Times of India, dated November 1: The Prime Minister, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, today attacked the opposition saying "our enemies are not the enemies of the Congress (I) alone. They are also the enemies of the nation". (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VIRENDRA VERMA (Uttar Pradesh): Do you agree with this?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : इतनी महान रैली हुई और उस पर इस तरह की बातें की जा रही हैं।

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : क्या यह ठीक कहा है ?

श्री पर्वतनेनि उपेन्द्र : हिंदी में है—हमारे दुश्मन कांग्रेस के ही दुश्मन नहीं देश के दुश्मन है । . . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

Let me complete. Why are you so exercised? It is not the Times of India alone. The Statesman reports: "Our enemies (the opposition) are not . . . (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): Everything is in brackets.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The enemies are not the enemies of the Congress alone, but of the country. The Free Press Journal, the Business Standard, Calcutta, the Amrita Bazar Patrika, Calcutta, the Indian Express, all carry the same words. Sir, as they say, if he had referred to . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . .

Will you allow me to complete?

AN HON. MEMBER: It is the enemies of the Congress Party, not of the Government. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, will you stop them? Let me complete my submissions. They are barricading like this. They won't let me complete my sentence. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: He has finished.

ठाकुर जगपाल सिंह (लद्दम प्रदेश) : सभापति महोदय, कांग्रेस की रैली थी . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

डा. अबरार अहमद खान (राजस्थान) : वह कांग्रेस-जनों से बात कर रहे थे। . . . (व्यवधान)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: If the Prime Minister had meant, as Mr. Shiv Shanker is suggesting, external enemies, the proper words would have been 'enemies of the country' and not 'enemies of Congress-I' because external forces are not enemies of Congress-I; they are enemies of the nation . . . (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let them contradict and clarify. Why should they shout? They can clarify it.. (*Interruptions*) Let them clarify or contradict. Let me complete. What is this? (*Interruptions*). This is unfair. There is no doubt about the Prime Minister's intentions, because I quote from the Jan Satta. . (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN: You need not quote all this.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: I am not being allowed to complete: You have permitted me, Sir.

SHRI P. N. SUKUL (Uttar Pradesh): You are quoting Congress President.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: फिर विपक्ष के बारे में वह बोले,

"रोज हम देख रहे हैं, नीतियां बदल रही हैं, विचारधारा बदल रही है। एक दिन हम देखते है कि हिंदी कट्टरपन की आवाज उठा रहे हैं, दूसरे दिन हम देखते है कि तमिल कट्टरपन की आवाज उठा रहे हैं, तीसरे दिन.. (व्यवधान)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): Can he make submissions here or not? Please control them. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: He is a Telugu speaking man, trying to read Hindi and this is not a matter they should ridicule him. (*Interruptions*).

Mr. CHAIRMAN: He is completing his speech and, as Mr. Advani has said, we should really welcome; he comes from a non-Hindi-speaking area and he is trying to read Hindi. If he commits a mistake, you should tolerate it. He is completing. No interruptions please. Let us proceed.

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY (West Bengal): What is the relevance of this? How can he be allowed to read out?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have allowed him with full consideration, exercising my own right, and I don't think you have a right to challenge it.

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY: Then I shall also speak.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, I am not permitting you to speak.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:

"तीसरे दिन हम देखते हैं कि एक नीति के लोग, एक दम विरोधी नीति के लोग उनके साथ खड़े हो गए हैं" (व्यवधान)

Can I continue, Sir? (*Interruptions*)

"क्या हो रहा है ? हमारे दुश्मन कांग्रेस के दुश्मन नहीं, देश के दुश्मन हैं"

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): They want Italian accent. This is what they want.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: I am giving the context when he said this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Don't read the entire thing.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, I am completing. Only one sentence more. (*Interruptions*)

"वे हंसते हुए देख रहे है कि ऐसी शक्ति खड़ी हो रही है जिसकी नीति नहीं है, जिसका सिद्धान्त नहीं है।" (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VIRENDRA VERMA: They are justifying the statement of the Prime Minister.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, this is the context in which he said this. There is no ambiguity about the intentions of the Prime Minister. He meant the Opposition. It is a very serious charge against the Opposition It is a very irresponsible statement made by the Prime Minister. He has not contradicted it. Two days have passed. Yesterday, Opposition leaders have issued a joint statement. Even then, the Prime Minister of the Government have not clarified. Therefore, it is presumed that they stand by this statement.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bhagat.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Sir, one clarification Only one minute.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want to supplement what Mr. Upendra has said. Only one sentence. (*Interruptions*) This is the headline in 'The Times of India'. It says 'Oppoition nation's foe'.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have called Mr. Bhagat. (*Interruptions*)

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश): सभापति जी, प्रधानमंत्री को बुलाना चाहिए, उनकी स्पीच है।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: As many as nine States are ruled by Oppisition parties. Does it mean that all these States are ruled by the enemies of the nation? (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT): Sir, I wish to categorically refute... (*Interruptions*)

श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): प्रधानमंत्री ने कहा है तो प्रधानमंत्री को बुलाया जाए।

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : सभापति जी, मेरा निवेदन है कि प्रधानमंत्री जी को बुलाया जाए।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: When did he become the Prime Minister? It was the statement of the Prime Minister. Let him come and answer.

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: I wish to refute... (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The proceedings, as I said earlier, will go on much better if there are no such interruptions. I have called Mr. Bhagat. Let him have his say. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: I am speaking on behalf of the Government. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is against the Prime Minister. Let the Prime Minister come and explain.

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: Sir, I wish to categorically refute the charge that the Prime Minister has said that the enemies of the Congress are the enemies of the country. I wish to categorically refute this charge. The Prime Minister did not say this. What he said, I will read out. (*Interruptions*)

What the Prime Minister has said is—I will read it out and I want every word to go on record, and I want to set the record straight:

"हमारे दुश्मन कांग्रेस के दुश्मन नहीं, देश के दुश्मन हंसते हुए देख रहे हैं कि ऐसी शक्ति खड़ी हुई है जिसकी नीति नहीं है, सिद्धान्त नहीं है ."...

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You are caught! ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: That is exactly what we say. ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: Sir, I want every word to go on record.

"हमारे दुश्मन कांग्रेस के दुश्मन नहीं देश के दुश्मन हंसते हुए देख रहे है कि ऐसी शक्ति खड़ी हुई है जिसकी नीति नहीं है, सिद्धांत नहीं है। वे देख रहे हैं और वे जानते हैं कि जब ऐसी शक्तियां खड़ी होती हैं तो देश कमजोर होता है, गिरता है ."..

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He is confirming the statement of the Prime Minister.

श्री च० क० एल० भगत : उन्होंने कहा—देश कमजोर होत है गिरत है...

We stand by every word of what he said... (*Interruptions*)..

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Whom do you name, whom did the Prime Minister name? Sir, this is a serious allegation that the Prime Minister has made... (*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I just tried to know one thing--whether the meeting at the Red Fort was a Congress meeting or a Government meeting... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It may be a Congress meeting, but no Prime Minister of India in the past has made such a statement against the Opposition as such ..(*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: The Prime Minister of the country cannot be equated with the President of the ruling party, and he is equating the Prime Minister with the President of the ruling party.

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: It was a Congress meeting, a Congress rally. You use your wisdom . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . Sir, in your wisdom you allowed him to raise this matter about the Congress meeting.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Can you categorically say it was not meant against the Opposition?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA) in the Chair]

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: I set the record straight, and I repeat a hundred times that the Opposition is unprincipled, unscrupulous . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He has confirmed the statement of the Prime Minister. No Prime Minister before had condemned the Opposition like this . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let him categorically say whether the Prime Minister had meant the Opposition or not.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: No Prime Minister of India has so far made such an accusation against the Opposition.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER): Sir, may I just explain? . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I am allowed to say a few words. I would like to make a submission to this House that the Prime Minister was never referring to the opposition parties . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . Let me say something and then you can find fault if there is anything wrong. You kindly give me achance to say a few words.

The Prime Minister was making a reference about enemies outside the country . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . The Prime Minister was also referring about the terrorists, about the fundamentalists and so on. Now may I request you kindly to just appreciate what I am saying? He has said:

हमारे दुश्मन कांग्रेस के दुश्मन नहीं, देश के दुश्मन . . . .

When he is saying this, this is with reference to the enemies of the country, not . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . Will you kindly listen to me? May be you have your own say, but kindly listen to what I am saying. Then he said:

हमारे दुश्मन, कांग्रेस के दुश्मन नहीं, देश के दुश्मन हंसते हुए देख रहे है क्या हो रहा है । देख रहे हैं ऐसी शक्तियां खड़ी हुई है । यह जो शक्ति खड़ी हुई है . . . .

this, of course, is the reference to the new party which has just come into existence I am not denying that . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . But read it.

हंसते हुए देख रहे है ऐसी शक्ति खड़ी हुई है जिसकी नीति नहीं है, सिद्धांत नहीं है । वे देख रहे हैं और वे जानते है कि जब ऐसी वेसिद्धांतिक शक्तियां खड़ी होती है तो देश कमजोर होता है, गिरता हैं ।

kindly tell me what is wrong . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . what is wrong?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: We have not objected to that part but the earlier one . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

श्री पी० शिवशंकर चोर की दाढ़ीमें तिनका । अगर आप नहीं समझे तो हम क्या करें ।

I am trying to explain to you that so far as this is concerned, it does not concern you . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, I have read the whole paragraph. This charge is in the context of that. We are not worried if they criticize the policies and programmes of any party: we also criticize. But we take exception to the charge that the Opposition

parties are anti-national. The whole thing is in just one paragraph. How can you delete one sentence from that ?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Now there is nothing for discussion--the matter is over.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The context in which the Prime Minister has made the statement definitely proves that he meant the Opposition. Mr. Shiv Shanker has read out some lines: I go along with him. Let him read it again. Let him forget that he is a Member of the ruling party. Anybody who reads that para will say that the Prime Minister meant that the Opposition are enemies of the Congress and enemies of the nation.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: That is the meaning. I do not want to charge the Prime Minister. My simple request is, let the Prime Minister come here and clarify the position, and we are prepared to accept it.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, Mr. Shiv Shanker, the Leader of the House, read out a part of the speech and asked what was wrong in the speech. Apparently there is nothing wrong in the speech as such. But in the speech, in a particular background, in a particular context, certain words have to be understood, certain features have to be understood. Mr. Shiv Shanker will surely agree with me—he is a lawyer—that it is not a question of sophistry alone. It is the question of a political speech. When you attack an Opposition party, you are at liberty to call an Opposition party the enemy of your party. But when you accuse an Opposition party as an enemy of the nation, it means that that Opposition party indulges in anti-national activities.

Sir, *The Times of India's* headlines was, "Opposition Nation's Foe." Just listen. I quote:

"The Prime Minister, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, ..."

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): You said "only one second." Please sit down.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: He has asked me to show what is wrong. Mr. Chairman, today what is the character of our country?

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: Let the Prime Minister deny.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): Let us not enter into an argument. You have made your point. Please sit down.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: As many as nine States in our country are being run by one or the other party other than the Congress (I). Does it mean that the nine States are ruled by anti-national forces? Tomorrow the Prime Minister will call the Opposition parties to a meeting to discuss Punjab affairs, to discuss electoral reforms. Will the Prime Minister be consulting anti-national forces?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): Mr. Dipen Ghosh, please sit down.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: May I just say this much, Sir....

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let the Prime Minister come and make clarification.

SHRI P SHIV SHANKER: On what has appeared in the newspapers they had some misgivings which they brought to the notice of the House. We have explained that the word "enemies" does not refer to the Opposition. They should be satisfied with this. But, if they cannot be satisfied, we cannot help it.

(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: If this is the stand of the Government, we are not prepared to accept you explanation. Let the Prime Minister come and clarify.

संसदीय कार्य मंत्री तथा सूचना और प्रसारण मंत्री (श्री एच०के०एल० भगत): :

[श्री एच० के० एल० भगत]

श्रीमन प्रधान मंत्री ने यह नहीं कहा है जो ये लोग कह रहे हैं... (व्यवधान) । ये खामखाह हल्ला कर रहे है । यह चोर की दाढ़ी में तिनका क्यों है ... (व्यवधान) । हमारी रेली सफल हो गई इसलिए इनको तकलीफ हो रही है । खामखाह गलत बात कह रहे हैं... (व्यवधान)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We do not accept your explanation. We are not satisfied.

[At this stage some hon. Members left the chamber].

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: They have started the session with obstruction. This is what they are doing, wasting the time of the House. They have been demoralised. After the rally they are just frustrated. That is all.

SHRI GHULAM RASOOD MATTO (Jammu and Kashmir): I want to give a little explanation. Mr. H. K. L. Bhagat gave a transcript of the actual speech. One has to understand the Urdu language or the Hindi language to understand it.

हमारे दुश्मन कांग्रेस के ही दुश्मन नहीं हैं, देश के दुश्मन हैं ।

It means, enemies of not only the Congress but of the entire country.

SPECIAL MENTIONS

Death of many persons due to Japanese Encephalitis in Uttar Pradesh

श्री हरि सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश): मान्यवर उत्तर प्रदेश के गोरखपुर डिवीजन और देश के कई अन्य जिलों में यह मस्तिष्क ज्वर या जापानी एन्सेफलाइटिस बड़ी तेजी से फैल रहा है । अखबारों के जरिए से जो खबरें मिली हैं उनसे पता चलता है कि पांच हजार से भी ज्यादा बच्चे, आदमी और नवयुवक इस बीमारी से मर चुके है । इस बीमारी की सबसे पहले जानकारी 25 साल पहले प्राप्त हुई थी कि मस्तिष्क ज्वर फैल रहा है और उसके कारण मृत्यु हो रही है । लेकिन अभी तक इस बीमारी पर काबू नहीं पाया गया है और न ही कोई अच्छी दवा इसके इलाज के लिए निकल पाई है । बार-बार यह बीमारी उत्तरप्रदेश के गोरखपुर, आजमगढ़, देवरिया और बस्ती जिलों में ही नहीं फैल रही है बल्कि देश के अन्य जिलों में भी बड़ी तेजी से फैल रही है । मुख्तलिफ अस्पतालों और अखबारों से पता चलता है कि सिर्फ उत्तर प्रदेश में ही 25-30 आदमी इस बीमारी से मर जाते हैं । इससे पता चलता है कि इस बीमारी में लोगों की जल्दी मृत्यु हो जाती है लेकिन इस की रोकथाम के लिए सरकार कोई कारगर स्टेप नहीं उठा रही है जिससे कि इस बीमारी पर काबू पाया जा सके । इस बीमारी के कारण लोगों की जो मौतें हो रही है इसकी कोई दवा अभी तक सरकार नहीं निकाल पाई है । कोई ऐसी दवा या ऐसा वैक्सीन नहीं निकाला जा सका है जिससे इस बीमारी पर कंट्रोल किया जा सके या इस बीमारी को पहले से रोका जा सके । अभी भी हमारे सूबे, उत्तर प्रदेश में इस बीमारी पर कंट्रोल करने के लिये, इस बीमारी को खत्म करने के लिये कोई कारगर उपाय नहीं किया जा रहा है । 25 हजार के लगभग लोग इस बीमारी से प्रभावित हो चुके है लेकिन अभी तक सरकार इस बीमारी के कारणों का पता नहीं लगा सकी है और अभी तक इसके कारणों का पता लगाने में असमर्थ रही है ।

मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से प्रार्थना करना चाहता हूं यह जो बीमारी है, जो बड़ी भयंकर है इस पर कंट्रोल करना बहुत आवश्यक है । इस पर कंट्रोल करने के लिये केन्द्रीय सरकार को तवज्जह देना चाहिए । जो देश के वैज्ञानिक है, जो बीमारियों की जांच करने वाले है उनको इस बीमारी पर कंट्रोल पाने के लिये कोई वैक्सीन निकालनी चाहिए । अगर, इसके लिये जरूरी हो तो दूसरे देश के एक्सपर्टस को, जैसे जापान है, जिसको इस बीमारी